



Doc. 11535

20 March 2008

Observation of the Parliamentary Elections in Monaco (3 February 2008)

Election observation report¹

Bureau of the Assembly

Rapporteur: Mr Jaakko LAAKSO, Finland, Group of the Unified European Left

Contents	Page
1. Introduction	1
2. The pre-election period	2
2.1. Legal framework and electoral administration	2
2.2. Voters and candidates	2
2.3. The run-up to the election and the election campaign	3
2.4. The media	3
3. Election day	3
4. Results of the ballot	3
5. Conclusions	3
6. Recommendations	3
Appendix 1 – Monaco elections were free and fair, say Assembly observers, Strasbourg, 4 February 2008	4
Appendix 2 – Results – National elections 2008	5

1. Introduction

1. In response to an invitation from the Minister of State of Monaco, Mr Jean-Paul Proust, the Bureau of the Parliamentary Assembly decided, on 22 November 2007, to set up an ad hoc committee to observe the elections to the National Council (Parliament) of Monaco, which took place on 3 February 2008.

2. Based on the proposals of the Assembly's political groups, the ad hoc committee was composed as follows:

- Socialist Group (SOC)
 - Mr Leonid Slutsky, Russian Federation
- Group of the European People's Party (EPP/CD)
 - Mr Egidijus Vareikis, Lithuania
- Alliance of Liberals and Democrats for Europe (ALDE)
 - Mr Maximilian Reimann, Switzerland

1. Approved by the Bureau at its meeting on 13 March 2008.



- European Democrat Group (EDG)
 - Baroness Gloria Hooper, United Kingdom
 - Group of the Unified European Left (UEL)
 - Mr Jaakko Laakso, Finland
3. The Bureau appointed me as head of this ad hoc committee.
4. Secretariat support was provided by Mr Vladimir Dronov, Head of Secretariat, Interparliamentary Cooperation Department, and Ms Farida Jamal, Administrative Assistant.
5. The ad hoc committee met in Monaco from 1 to 4 February.
6. In addition to observing the actual voting and vote count, committee members met with Monégasque party leaders, the President of the National Council, the Minister of State, as well as the Mayor of Monaco, who is also Chairperson of the Electoral Committee. On election day, the committee observed the actual voting in Monaco's only polling station, the vote count following the closure of voting and visited the government election monitoring unit. The text of the press statement made following this observation exercise can be found in Appendix I. The Parliamentary Assembly delegation was the only international delegation to observe the 3 February elections.
7. Election day was characterised by a high voter turnout (76.85% – 4 854 Monégasques voted out of a total of 6 316 registered voters) and was in general calm. The electoral officials displayed remarkable efficiency and professionalism. The vote count was conducted effectively and in full compliance with existing regulations. It was carried out in a unique atmosphere of transparency where every national of Monaco could observe the process.
8. The delegation wishes to thank the Parliament of Monaco (National Council) and the office of the Minister of State for their co-operation and for the logistical support provided to the ad hoc committee.

2. The pre-election period

2.1. Legal framework and electoral administration

9. Following its accession to the Council of Europe in 2004, Monaco has yet to ratify the First Additional Protocol to the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) that safeguards, *inter alia*, the right to free elections.
10. Under the existing legislation, the parliament is elected for a term of five years, in a single round mixed majority/proportional election. Two thirds (18 members) of the National Council are appointed by majority vote, and go to those who have obtained the most votes. The remainder (8 seats) are filled by proportional vote based on the highest-average rule provided that the candidates are from a list that has obtained at least 5% of the votes.
11. According to the Election Law, the administration of the election process is organised by the office of the Mayor of Monaco, with the mayor acting as Chairperson of the Electoral Committee.

2.2. Voters and candidates

12. All Monégasque nationals who are 18 and above are eligible to vote. Only nationals of Monaco (including naturalised Monégasques) are entitled to stand in an election. To exercise the right to vote, a person has to present himself/herself at the country's only polling station, produce an identity card and a voter's card. Existing legislation does not provide for voting by postal correspondence, postal voting or voting in the few Monégasque embassies abroad. People in hospitals could also be disenfranchised as the procedure does not provide for mobile ballot boxes. However, to take care of these situations, the law allows voting by proxy.
13. Candidates belonging to three lists ran in these elections: Union Pour Monaco (UPM), Rassemblement et Enjeux pour Monaco (REPM) and Monaco Ensemble (ME). In accordance with Monaco's legislation that provides for mixing candidates during the vote, in addition to voting for the lists, voters could vote for individual candidates from different lists (see paragraph 10, above).

2.3. The run-up to the election and the election campaign

14. The election campaign was low key. Since traditionally no opinion polls were conducted the outcome of the election was rather unclear even to the political elite.

15. In a welcome development, the office of the mayor conducted a voters' awareness-raising campaign, producing booklets and posters that clarified the rather complicated voting procedures in Monaco's mixed system.

16. The delegation was informed by some interlocutors that there was a degree of discontent in the Monégasque electorate due to the belated publication of political programmes of the stakeholders which, allegedly, did not allow the electorate to obtain a full picture of the different political platforms. There were mutual recriminations across the three lists lamenting the unwillingness of their leaders to engage in public debate. Local media published information concerning financial resources, collected by political lists, as well the use of those funds.

2.4. The media

17. Monaco has no legislation governing media behaviour in an electoral campaign. In general, in the absence of specific legislation, coverage of the electoral campaign by the media was pluralistic. The media sought to observe equal allocation of attention to the three contesting camps, even though no law in Monaco requires them to do so.

3. Election day

18. Parliamentary Assembly observers were able to obtain a comprehensive picture of the voting and the vote count. The elections were well organised and conducted in an orderly manner. The delegation regarded the administration of the elections as exemplary.

19. The vote count was an exercise in an extraordinary transparency, by international standards, with a significant proportion of Monégasque nationals present.

4. Results of the ballot

20. The results of the ballot (see Appendix II) produced a parliament composed of members of two of the three lists that ran in the elections, with UMP obtaining 21 out of the 24 seats and REPM getting three seats.

5. Conclusions

21. The ad hoc committee agreed that, given the particular situation of Monaco, the election was largely in line with Council of Europe electoral standards. The Electoral Commission conducted its work in an impartial and professional manner, displaying great transparency and efficiency.

22. The ad hoc committee considers that the results of the elections are indicative of massive support by the Monégasques for the reforms conducted by the state. This should encourage the authorities to continue working towards full implementation of Monaco's commitments vis-à-vis the Council of Europe, including the ratification of the First Additional Protocol to the ECHR.

23. The ad hoc committee is confident that these elections mark an important milestone along the road of Monaco's further integration into the Council of Europe.

6. Recommendations

24. While no problems have been reported concerning media behaviour, the Monégasque authorities should consider introducing new media legislation that would, *inter alia*, specifically address media behaviour during the electoral campaign.

25. The ad hoc committee reiterates the Assembly recommendation inviting the Monégasque authorities to reflect on the need to adopt a law on political parties, not least with a view to ensuring the transparency of party funding.

Appendix 1 – Monaco elections were free and fair, say Assembly observers, Strasbourg, 4 February 2008

Strasbourg, 04.02.2008 – The 3 February 2008 parliamentary elections in Monaco were free and fair. They were well organised and their result is a true expression of the will of the electorate, concluded a five-member, cross-party delegation of observers from the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE).

The delegation was impressed with the high voter turnout of 77 per cent, which testifies to the confidence of Monegasques that every vote counts. This public mood bodes well for the future of representative democracy in this particular constitutional monarchy.

The elections were competitive: the electorate was able to choose from three lists reflecting various shades and colours of the political spectrum. The elections set a good example for the Council of Europe in terms of holding free, fair and well administered elections.

The Office of the Mayor of Monaco, in its capacity of election administrator, has done a commendable job in awareness-raising in the run-up to the elections. The vote-count was an exercise in efficiency and unprecedented openness for all.

Naturally, even in good elections there is always scope for improvement. The early publication of political programmes would have ensured timely and full information for voters with regard to the political plans of the contestants. Public debates would have helped the electorate to acquire a better understanding of the three platforms.

On the whole, these elections marked a step forward towards Monaco's full compliance with its obligations and commitments as a Council of Europe member state.

The delegation,² led by Jaakko Laakso (Finland, UEL), was in Monaco at the invitation of Jean-Paul Proust, Minister of State of Monaco. It held discussions, among others, with the Minister of State, the Mayor of Monaco, representatives of the three lists of candidates, Monaco's PACE delegation, and a cross-section of the media.

The delegation wishes to thank the offices of the Minister of State and the Mayor of Monaco, as well as the National Council, for their excellent co-operation in the organisation of the visit.

2. The members of the delegation were Jaakko Laakso (Finland, UEL), head of delegation, Leonid Slutsky (Russian Federation, SOC), Egidijus Vareikis (Lithuania, EPP/CD), Maximilian Reimann (Switzerland, ALDE) and Baroness Gloria Hooper (United Kingdom, EDG).

Appendix 2 – Results – National elections 2008

Registered	6 316
Voters	4 854
Turnout	76.85%
Blank	80
Invalid	124

First-past-the-post system

Elected	Lists	Number of votes
ROBILLON Jean-François	Union pour Monaco	2 403
FAUTRIER Catherine	Union pour Monaco	2 383
NOTARI Fabrice	Union pour Monaco	2 327
BORDERO Alexandre	Union pour Monaco	2 319
DITTLLOT Michèle	Union pour Monaco	2 313
SVARA Pierre	Union pour Monaco	2 303
GARDETTO Jean-Charles S.	Union pour Monaco	2 300
SPILOTIS-SAQUET Christophe	Union pour Monaco	2 279
VALERI Stéphane	Union pour Monaco	2 274
CLERISSI Philippe	Union pour Monaco	2 266
LORENZI Pierre	Union pour Monaco	2 261
POYARD-VATRICAN Anne	Union pour Monaco	2 256
BERTRAND Gérard	Union pour Monaco	2 247
BOCCONE-PAGES Brigitte	Union pour Monaco	2 241
BOUHNİK-LAVAGNA Sophie	Union pour Monaco	2 237
ROSE Guillaume	Union pour Monaco	2 221

Proportional representation

Elected	Lists	Number of votes
STEINER Christophe	Rassemblement et enjeux pour Monaco	1 838
BURINI Marc	Rassemblement et enjeux pour Monaco	1 798
NOUVION Laurent	Rassemblement et enjeux pour Monaco	1 793
MARQUET Bernard	Union pour Monaco	2 184
CELLARIO Claude	Union pour Monaco	2 167
MANZONE-SAQUET Nicole	Union pour Monaco	2 133
GUAZZONNE Eric	Union pour Monaco	2 120
MARQUET Roland	Union pour Monaco	2 101

Number of seats

List	Number of seats	Number of votes
Union pour Monaco	21	53 523
Rassemblement et enjeux pour Monaco	3	41 512
Monaco Ensemble	0	7 491

“Union Pour Monaco”

Candidates	Number of votes	Elected
ALESSANDRI Jessica	2 079	

Candidates	Number of votes	Elected
BATTAGLIA Maryse	2 067	
BERTRAND Gérard	2 247	Elected
BOCCONE-PAGES Brigitte	2 241	Elected
BONNAL Isabelle	2 042	
BORDERO Alexandre	2 319	Elected
BOUHNİK-LAVAGNA Sophie	2 237	Elected
CELLARIO Claude	2 167	Elected
CLERISSI Philippe	2 266	Elected
DITLOT Michèle	2 313	Elected
FAUTRIER Catherine	2 383	Elected
GARDETTO Jean-Charles S.	2 300	Elected
GUAZZONNE Eric	2 120	Elected
LORENZI Pierre	2 261	Elected
MANZONE-SAQUET Nicole	2 133	Elected
MARQUET Bernard	2 184	Elected
MARQUET Roland	2 101	Elected
NOTARI Fabrice	2 327	Elected
POYARD-VATRICAN Anne	2 256	Elected
ROBILLON Jean-François	2 403	Elected
ROSE Guillaume	2 221	Elected
SPILOTIS-SAQUET Christophe	2 279	Elected
SVARA Pierre	2 303	Elected
VALERI Stéphane	2 274	Elected

“Rassemblement et Enjeux pour Monaco”

Candidates	Number of votes	Elected
BARIA Guy	1 709	
BERTI Christian	1 658	
BLANCHY Jean-Baptiste	1 764	
BOISSON Rainier	1 757	
BURINI Marc	1 798	Elected
CROVETTO Bertrand	1 760	
DICK Georges	1 673	
ELENA Martine	1 689	
FICINI Alain	1 722	
FRESKO-ROLFO Béatrice	1 684	
GRIMAUD-PALMERO Patricia	1 689	
KERN-de MILLO TERRAZZANI Elodie	1 749	
LIBERATORE-VITTORIOSO Anne	1 720	
MAGNAN Guy	1 733	
MULLOT Richard	1 790	
NOGHES-MENIO Cristina	1 641	
NOUVION Laurent	1 793	Elected
POYET Thierry	1 751	
PRAT Bernard	1 720	
ROSTICHER Claude	1 753	
STEINER Christophe	1 838	Elected
TCHOBANIAN Joël	1 719	
VACCAREZZA Claude	1 702	

Candidates	Number of votes	Elected
DE VEIGY-BROUSSE Géraldine	1 700	

“Monaco Ensemble”

Candidates	Number of votes	Elected
AGLIARDI Claudine	378	
BOERI Daniel	483	
BOISSON Claude	654	
DICK Pierre	398	
FERREYROLLES Franck	429	
FERREYROLLES Guy-Philippe	398	
GENINAZZA-BACHÉ Martine	396	
GIORDANO René	568	
LE JOLIFF Audrey	437	
L'HERBON DE LUSSATS Jean	395	
LICARI Jean-Pierre	679	
MARESCHI Gabrielle	392	
NIGIONI Jean-Luc	583	
RIT Jacques	830	
WOOLLEY Patrice	471	