



Doc. 11912
14 May 2009

Expenditure of the Parliamentary Assembly for the financial year 2010

Report¹

Committee on Economic Affairs and Development
Rapporteur: Mr Paul WILLE, Belgium

1. Reference to committee: Standing mandate.



A. Draft opinion

1. In pursuance of Resolution (53) 38 of the Committee of Ministers and Article 24 of the Financial Regulations, the Parliamentary Assembly issues an opinion each year concerning the appropriations relating to its operation. The amounts allocated to the Assembly appear in Vote III of the ordinary budget of the Council of Europe and cover its expenditure on staff, the costs associated with the functioning of its political groups and its own operating expenses, including the interparliamentary co-operation programme.
2. As the Spanish Chair of the Committee of Ministers rightly pointed out, the Assembly gives the Council of Europe its political impetus. Over the sixty years of its existence as a debating forum and a sounding board for the concerns of Europe's citizens, its work has proved of vital importance in promoting the values of the Council of Europe throughout the continent and elsewhere.
3. The texts (opinions, resolutions, recommendations) adopted by the Assembly provide key guidelines for the Committee of Ministers and the member states' governments and parliaments. The Assembly is the driving force behind many international treaties or standard-setting instruments, such as the European Convention on Human Rights. Its monitoring procedure and its election observation missions make a very important contribution to the defence of pluralist democracy in Europe.
4. The Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights, Thomas Hammarberg, moreover recently stated "Parliamentarians have an important role to play in building a sustainable human rights culture in their own country. Moreover, their role is fundamental in ensuring that a government's human rights pledges are not forgotten."
5. However, if the Assembly is to be able fully to play its role of watchdog regarding the observance of democratic standards and rules, it must have the necessary financial resources. As it must always be ready to react, a fundamental principle governs the management of its budget: covering the funding needs of all its activities. The budget must accordingly be managed with sufficient flexibility to allow it to react in real time to political developments and issues, which are often unpredictable.
6. For this reason, at their 246th meeting in June 1975 the Ministers' Deputies decided that the budgetary package technique could be applied to that part of the Assembly's budget covering its operating costs. In this context they agreed that "the development of the Assembly's budget – which is an operating budget – cannot be linked with that of the Organisation as a whole, whose evolution often depends on decisions connected with the Organisation's work programme, and also on factors totally extraneous to operational expenditure which play their part in the annual variation of the budget total."
7. To date, thanks to thrifty management, no major activity envisaged by the Assembly or its bodies has been hindered for lack of funds, despite significant cuts in the appropriations allocated to it for the last three years.
8. This reduction in its budget has obliged the Assembly to make huge efforts to rationalise its operations and its working methods. For instance, the Assembly has speeded up its transition to the paperless age of the new technologies, notably by replacing with a CD-Rom the final printed version of the verbatim records of its proceedings, eliminating the printed compendiums of the Assembly's official documents, creating an Extranet site for Assembly members' exclusive use (to do away with the transmission of documents in hard copy format) and gradually reducing the number of documents printed during part-sessions.
9. In parallel with these efforts, the Assembly has decided to limit meetings of its committees and to prefer Strasbourg and Paris as locations for meetings, principally so as to save on interpretation costs. Meetings are no longer held in Budapest, nor certain locations distant from the Organisation's traditional language basins.
10. The Assembly is aware of the budget problems faced by member states of the Council of Europe due to the global economic and financial crisis. It is therefore ready to review all of its expenditure with the aim of generating new savings not affecting its core operations, so as not to increase the burden of the contributions payable to the various budgets of the Council of Europe by the member states, some of which are confronted with serious budget difficulties.
11. In view of the exceptional circumstances, the Assembly is prepared to make a 2% saving on its operating expenditure for 2010. This will primarily concern documents production and distribution, elimination of the verbatim records of debates in German and Italian, elimination of the minutes of plenary sittings – which will lead to a reorganisation of the Table Office – and a reduction in the number of meetings held outside Strasbourg or Paris by the ten committees, on the basis of one external meeting per committee every two

years. Only five committees will therefore be permitted to hold an external plenary meeting in 2010. The five others must hold their meetings in either Strasbourg or Paris. These changes will allow significant savings on interpretation costs and official journey expenses.

12. Despite these budget cuts, in 2010 the Assembly will continue its monitoring procedures and fact-finding missions in a number of member states, the observation of elections in states subject to the monitoring or post-monitoring procedure and the interparliamentary co-operation programme spanning several years, in accordance with its Resolution 1548 (2007) on the progress of its monitoring procedure.

13. Nonetheless, the Assembly does not want to pave the way for its own weakening, since it is the only purely European parliamentary institution in which national delegations representing the 47 member states of the Council of Europe regularly come together. For this reason it is against proposing more significant reductions which would affect its core operations, namely a greater reduction in meetings of its committees, and possibly even their functioning, or a reduction in the duration of its part-sessions. This is because the Assembly remains the only European parliamentary forum that allows the national parliaments of member states to debate and work together with a view to finding solutions to the challenges confronting today's Europe.

14. Moreover, the Assembly points out that, under Article 22 of the European Convention on Human Rights, it elects the judges of the Court with respect to each High Contracting Party. It accordingly wishes to bring together within its secretariat all of the administrative functions relating to the procedure for electing the judges, currently performed by different parts of the intergovernmental sector. For this reason, so as to comply with the Convention and avoid delays in the procedure, the Assembly wishes to set up a unit which would be responsible for all communications with the High Contracting Parties.

15. Lastly, the Assembly notes that its request concerning the replacement of the vote display panels with large-format video walls has been included in the 2009-2013 investment plan with the expenditure scheduled for 2011.

Appended to this opinion are:

- i. a table of the requests for 2010, presented according to the results-based budgeting (RBB) method, the simplification of which led the secretariat of the Assembly to present the budget under a single activity area: functioning of the Assembly;
- ii. a brief explanation of the main items of expenditure;
- iii. a table setting out the Assembly's work programme according to the RBB method.

Appendix 1 – Vote III of the ordinary budget – Expenditure of the Assembly

Vote III of the ordinary budget – Expenditure of the Assembly Titre III du budget ordinaire – Dépenses relatives à l'Assemblée	Appropriations for 2010 Crédits demandés au budget de 2010 €
Head 0310 – Functioning of the Assembly	
Chapitre 0310 – Fonctionnement de l'Assemblée	
Dépenses de personnel/Staff expenditure	
Sub-heads/Articles	
0000001 – Remuneration of staff recruited on established posts Rémunération du personnel recruté dans le cadre des emplois permanents	8 469 300
0000003 – Remuneration and accessory charges of temporary staff Rémunération et charges accessoires du personnel temporaire	680 100
0000046 – Remuneration of staff on position Rémunération du personnel sur fonction à durée déterminée	415 100
0000005 – Salary, allowances and social charges of the Secretary General of the Assembly Rémunération, indemnités et charges sociales du Secrétaire général de l'Assemblée	257 100
0000007 – Overtime – statutory and other allowances Heures supplémentaires – indemnités statutaires et autres	p.m.
0000013 – Secondment of national civil servants to the Assembly Fonctionnaires nationaux mis à disposition de l'Assemblée	p.m.
0000016 – Recruitment, arrival and departure expenses – Home leave Frais de recrutement à l'arrivée et au départ – congé dans le pays d'origine	31 300
Total Staff expenditure Total dépenses de personnel	9 852 900
Supplies, services and other operational expenditure	
Dépenses de matériel et autres dépenses de fonctionnement	
Sub-heads/Articles	
0000054 – Equipment Équipement	12 900
0000080 – Official journeys Frais de missions	290 000
0000095 – Representational expenditure, other official expenditure and travelling expenses of members of the Assembly Dépenses de représentation, frais de fonction et déplacement des membres de l'Assemblée	350 000
0000115 – Interpretation Interprétation	1 771 300
0000116 – Translation Traduction	514 800
0000124 – Publishing and printing Publications et impressions	410 100
0000125 – Outsourced production of documents Production externalisée de documents	33 000
0000129 – Consultation of experts Consultation d'experts	131 600
0000162 – Expenditure pertaining to the Private Office of the President of the Assembly/ Dépenses du Cabinet du Président de l'Assemblée	60 000
0000163 – Official expenses of the President of the Assembly Frais de fonction du Président de l'Assemblée	90 000
0000166 – Expenses for inviting guests of the Parliamentary Assembly Dépenses d'accueil des invités de l'Assemblée parlementaire	p.m.

Vote III of the ordinary budget – Expenditure of the Assembly Titre III du budget ordinaire – Dépenses relatives à l'Assemblée	Appropriations for 2010 Crédits demandés au budget de 2010 €
0000171 – Organisation of ad hoc conferences Organisation de conférences ad hoc	125 000
0000204 – Modernisation of the Assembly's equipment Modernisation de l'équipement de l'Assemblée	p.m.
0000205 – European prizes Prix européens	83 000
0000206 – Operating and maintenance costs of the electronic voting system Coûts de maintenance et d'exploitation du vote électronique	41 800
0000250 – Co-operation and monitoring programme Programme de coopération et du suivi des engagements	694 300
0000370 – Allocation to Assembly's political groups Dotation des groupes politiques de l'Assemblée	726 800
0000392 – Other expenditure not specifically provided for in this vote Autres dépenses non spécialement prévues au présent titre	100 000
Total supplies, services and other operational expenditure Total dépenses de matériel et autres dépenses de fonctionnement	5 434 600
Total Vote III Total du titre III	15 287 500

Election of judges Election des juges	Appropriations for 2010 Crédits demandés au budget de 2010 €
Head 0310 – Functioning of the Assembly Chapitre 0310 – Fonctionnement de l'Assemblée	
0000046 – Remuneration of staff on position Rémunération du personnel sur fonction à durée déterminée	54 000
Allocation to the special account «0186» PA Vote III Dotation au compte spécial «0186» AP titre III	
0000299 – Operational expenditure Dépenses opérationnelles	20 000

Appendix 2 – Staff expenditure

Vote III – Expenditure of the Assembly

This appropriation corresponds to the basic salaries, allowances (non-recurring and periodic) and social cover of the permanent staff of the secretariat of the Assembly (87 posts, including 1 specially appointed official) and of temporary staff (including 7 positions).

The Assembly currently has 10 committees, 9 of which have 84 members (with 84 alternates, except for the Monitoring Committee), while the 10th has 27 members (with no alternates). On 1 January 2009 the secretariat comprised 87 permanent posts, 7 positions and 1 specially appointed official, breaking down as follows:

Permanent posts:

1 specially appointed official		
1 A7	1 B6	1 C4
2 A6	4 B5	
11 A5	16 B4	
10 A4	13 B3	
21 A2/A3	7 B2	

Positions:

4 A1/2	1 B3	(1 B4/B5)
	2 B2	

At present, the secretariat of the Assembly is organised so that the 10 Assembly committees have 52 staff members working for them (30 A-grade and 20 B-grade) and 2 staff on fixed-term positions (including 1 B4 assigned to an A-grade post).

The remaining 42 staff members (37 permanent posts and 5 fixed-term positions) work for the Bureau of the Assembly, the Private Office of the President of the Assembly, the Table Office, the Interparliamentary Co-operation and Election Observation Units, the Parliamentary Assistance Unit, the Administration, Human Resources and Finance Unit, the Communication Unit, the Information Technology Unit or the Research and Documentation Unit.

Previous years' experience shows that the tasks of the seven positions are not linked with the implementation of a programme but correspond to permanent work financed by the general budget of the Assembly. Therefore, to conform with reality, the seven positions should be transformed into permanent posts.

Moreover, since the Assembly is responsible for electing the judges of the European Court of Human Rights with respect to each High Contracting Party, it wishes to set up a new unit within its secretariat to take charge of the entire election procedure, including communications with the High Contracting Parties. Part of the functions linked to this procedure are currently performed by the Directorate General of Human Rights and Legal Affairs. The transfer of these responsibilities would also require the transfer of a B4/B5 post to the Assembly secretariat or the creation of a position at the same grade.

Supplies, services and other operational expenditure

Since 1975, following a decision by the Committee of Ministers, these allocations have been voted in the form of a single appropriation, which continues to be divided into sub-heads. If the Assembly wished to change the relative amounts in the package at a later date, either because of an overall reduction or for any other reason dictated by the implementation of the budget, such a change would be carried out by the Secretary General at the Assembly's request and in accordance with Article 31 of the Financial Regulations.

To sum up, the draft budget for 2010 amounts to €15 287 500 in real terms (not including inflation and salary adjustments for 2010). The cost of a B4/B5 post, estimated at €54 000, linked to the procedure for the election of judges and a €20 000 allocation to special account "0186", to meet the travel and subsistence expenses of candidates participating in the sub-committee's interviews, should be added to this amount.

The appropriations can be analysed as follows:

Permanent and temporary staff:	9 852 900 €	Unit for the election of judges	54 000 €
Interpretation:	1 771 300 €		
Translation:	514 800 €		
Printing of documents:	443 100 €		
Allocation to the political groups:	726 800 €		
Sub-total	13 308 900 €		
Activities:	1 978 600 €	Allocation to special account	20 000 €
Total	15 287 500 €		74 000 €

Despite the reduction in its appropriations, in 2010 the Assembly will continue its monitoring procedures, its election observation missions in member states, its interparliamentary co-operation programme and the part of the programme concerned with training parliamentary officials of Council of Europe member states and of other parliamentary institutions. The objective of these programmes is to reinforce co-operation with the national parliaments, to enhance the visibility of the Assembly's activities and respond to issues and problems identified in various Assembly reports, including those issued by its Monitoring Committee.

The Assembly has a particular role to play here. This is because it is the only purely European parliamentary institution in which national delegations representing the 47 member states of the Council of Europe regularly come together (for twenty days per year during the part-sessions in Strasbourg, plus seventy to eighty days' work between sessions on the occasion of the meetings of the committees and sub-committees, not to mention other meetings, such as Bureau meetings or those of the Standing Committee). The Assembly is the only organisation, apart from the European Parliament, that offers such a frequency and density of activity by members of national parliaments within a single international body.

The Assembly committees will continue to organise a number of thematic hearings and conferences (two or three major conferences). The Assembly will also continue to co-operate closely with the other European parliamentary assemblies (the European Parliament, those of the OSCE and the CIS, etc.), or international parliamentary assemblies (the Pan-African Parliament, the Asian Parliamentary Assembly, the Latin American Parliament, etc.).

In addition, pursuant to Resolution 1420 (2005) on prospects for peace in the Middle East and the decision of the Assembly Bureau on 18 March 2005, the Sub-Committee on the Middle East will continue its co-operation with the Knesset and the Palestinian Legislative Council.

Lastly, the allocation to the political groups is based on a lump sum for secretarial assistance to each of the existing groups and an additional per capita amount, which varies according to membership.

Appendix 3 – Functioning of the Assembly

Functioning of the Assembly			
Intervention logic	Performance indicators	Sources of verification	Assumptions
Activity area objective			
Ensure the smooth functioning of the session and of the Assembly's various bodies.			
Expected result 1 The part-sessions are efficiently organised and run, and satisfy Assembly members' expectations.	At least 50% of registered speakers are given the floor. Adopted texts are transmitted to the bodies concerned.	List of speakers. Compilation of adopted texts. Minutes of the Bureau of the Assembly. Statement made by the Secretary General of the Parliamentary Assembly to the Ministers' Deputies.	Support from secretaries of national delegations
Expected result 2 Committee meetings, seminars and conferences take place in accordance with members' decisions.	Committee meetings are planned. Meeting agendas, documents and reports are ready in good time.	Agendas, synopses and minutes of committee meetings. Proceedings of seminars and conferences.	Availability of members
Expected result 3 Interparliamentary co-operation, observation of elections and assistance for national parliaments, is managed taking due account of political developments.	Co-operation activities are brought into line with wishes and needs expressed. Election observation missions are organised in accordance with the decisions of the Bureau of the Assembly.	List of activities. Reports on election observation missions.	Support from parliaments and political groups
Expected result 4 Raising of the Assembly's external profile	Media coverage of Assembly activities. Stock is taken of press releases and the number of visitors to the Assembly's website.	Press and news media (media analysis database, Factiva) Collection of statistics on media coverage.	

B. Explanatory memorandum, by Mr Paul Wille

1. Explanatory memorandum

1. This report analyses Vote III of the ordinary budget of the Council of Europe, and particularly the amounts allocated to the Assembly to cover expenditure on staff, costs associated with the functioning of the political groups, supplies, services and other operational outlay and the financing of the Assembly's interparliamentary co-operation programme. This choice of topics means that the common services of the Council of Europe, which form an integral part of the Assembly's operations, are not discussed here. For example, Vote III does not cover telephone bills, office supplies and equipment or other consumables, which are items of expenditure common to all departments within the Organisation.

2. I have therefore concentrated on proposals regarding the amount to be allocated to the Assembly for 2010, in strict accordance with the budgetary procedures in force. As in previous years, the Assembly leaves it to the Directorate of Finance to assess, in due course, the adjustments that are, or may need to be, made to its budget allocation for 2009 as a result of changes in salary scales, their implications for 2010 and the provision that needs to be made for salary adjustments in 2010. Similarly, it is for the Secretary General of the Council of Europe to adjust the other allocations, in due course, to take account of inflation.

3. I wish to reiterate that the Assembly's main tasks, which shape its programme of activities, are:

- its four-part plenary session;
- meetings of the Bureau and the Standing Committee between the part-sessions;
- meetings in either Strasbourg or Paris, lasting one or more days, at times other than the four part-sessions of the Assembly, for each of the 10 general committees, the sub-committees, the ad hoc committees of the Assembly or of the Bureau and specialised working parties;
- committee or sub-committee meetings outside Strasbourg or Paris;
- conferences, colloquies, seminars and parliamentary hearings;
- activities coming under the Assembly's programme of interparliamentary co-operation;
- election observation;
- the work of the political groups.

4. Having examined the Assembly's *modus operandi* and current structure, the rapporteur wishes to draw attention to its general strategy aimed, firstly, at maintaining the quality of its work and its ability, as a political body, to respond efficiently and rapidly to unforeseen events, and, secondly, at reinforcing in the medium and long term its assistance and co-operation capacities in respect of the national parliaments of the 47 member states of the Council of Europe.

5. For three years now the Secretariat of the Assembly has had to adapt to budget restrictions which have been imposed on it against the Assembly's wishes. Choices have therefore had to be made so as to maintain a constant level of service to the Assembly's bodies.

6. In particular, the Assembly has chosen to speed up its transition to the paperless age of the new technologies, notably by replacing with a CD-Rom the final printed version of the verbatim records of its proceedings, eliminating the printed compendiums of the Assembly's official documents, creating an Extranet site for Assembly members' exclusive use (to do away with sending documents in hard copy format) and drastically reducing the number of documents printed during part-sessions. This modernisation of the tools used will be pursued in 2009 and 2010.

7. In parallel with these efforts, the Assembly has decided to limit meetings of its committees and to prefer Strasbourg and Paris as locations for meetings, principally so as to save on interpretation costs. Meetings are no longer held in Budapest, or in certain locations distant from the Organisation's traditional language basins.

8. Aware that the current economic and financial crisis is seriously affecting the public finances of most member states of the Council of Europe, I have requested the Secretary General of the Assembly to identify expenditure cuts not affecting the normal functioning of the Assembly.

9. Moreover, under Article 22 of the European Convention on Human Rights, the Assembly elects the judges of the Court with respect to each high contracting party. It accordingly wishes to group together within its Secretariat a number of administrative functions relating to the procedure for electing the judges, currently

performed by the Directorate General of Human Rights and Legal Affairs and to a lesser extent the Committee of Ministers' Secretariat. This measure will require the transfer of a B4/B5 post to the Assembly Secretariat or the creation of a position at the same grade.

10. The measures taken by the Secretariat of the Assembly – a reduction in documents production and distribution expenses, elimination of the minutes of sittings, the elimination of the verbatim records of its debates in German and Italian and the implementation of a measure whereby committees will hold their annual meetings outside Strasbourg or Paris only once every two years – make it possible to generate a saving of €330 000. I am therefore able to present a draft budget for 2010 of €15 287 500 in real terms (not including inflation and salary adjustments for 2010). An amount of €54 000 for a B4/B5 position linked to the procedure for the election of judges and a €20 000 allocation to the special account intended to cover the travel and subsistence expenses of candidates for judicial office should be added to this amount.

To sum up the appropriations can be analysed as follows:

Permanent and temporary staff:	9 852 900 €	Unit for the election of judges	54 000 €
Interpretation:	1 771 300 €		
Translation:	514 800 €		
Printing of documents:	443 100 €		
Allocation to the political groups:	726 800 €		
Sub-total	13 308 900 €		
Activities:	1 978 600 €	Allocation to special account	20 000 €
Total	15 287 500 €		74 000 €

11. However, as rapporteur on the budget, I am not prepared to propose more significant reductions which would affect our core operations, namely a greater reduction in meetings of our committees, and possibly even their activities, or a reduction in the duration of our part-sessions. This is because the Assembly is a unique political forum for the whole of Europe and must have the means to remain the voice of democracy.

12. Having just received the Secretary General's document on budget priorities for 2010, in which he envisages reducing our appropriations by 2.7%, or possibly even more, I consider that my proposals represent the maximum we can accept. I also note that the reduction does not apply equally to all the administrative entities. Such a significant reduction is visibly not required in the cases of Vote I – General Services (covering the services of the Secretary General, the Committee of Ministers, political analysis, external relations, the Treaty Office, Internal Audit, Protocol and the Directorate of Communication) and Vote VI – Directorate General of Administration and Logistics.

13. Lastly, it should be noted that Appendix III presents the Assembly's activities under the results-based budgeting methodology.

Reporting committee: Committee on Economic Affairs and Development.

Reference to committee: Standing mandate.

Draft opinion adopted by the committee on 12 March 2009.

Members of the committee: Mr Márton **Braun** (Chairperson), Mr Robert Walter (Vice-Chairperson) (alternate: Baroness Detta **O'Cathain**), Mrs Doris Barnett (Vice-Chairperson), Mrs Antigoni Papadopoulos (Vice-Chairperson), Mr Ruhi **Açıkgöz**, Mr Ulrich Adam, Mr Pedro **Agramunt Font de Mora**, Mr Roberto Antonione, Mr Robert Arrigo (alternate: Mrs Marie-Louise **Coleiro Preca**), Mr Zigmantas Balčytis, Mrs Veronika Bellmann, Mr Radu Mircea Berceanu, Mr Vidar **Bjørnstad**, Mr Luuk Blom, Mr Pedrag Bošković, Mrs Maryvonne Blondin, Mr Patrick Breen (alternate: Mr Frank **Fahey**), Mr Erol Aslan **Cebeci**, Mrs Elvira **Cortajarena Iturrioz**, Mr Valeriu Cosarciuc, Mr Joan Albert Farré Santuré, Mr Relu Fenechiu, Mr Guiorgui **Gabashvili**, Mr Marco Gatti, Mr Zahari Georgiev, Mr Paolo **Giaretta**, Mr Francis Grignon, Mrs Arlette Grosskost (alternate: Mr Michel **Hunault**), Mrs Azra Hadžiahmetović, Mrs Karin Hakl, Mr Norbert **Hauptert**, Mr Stanislaw Huskowski, Mr Ivan Nikolaev Ivanov, Mr Igor Ivanovski, Mr Miloš Jevtić, Mrs Nataša Jovanović, Mr Antti **Kaikkonen**, Mr Emmanouil **Kefaloyiannis**, Mr Serhiy Klyuev, Mr Albrecht Konečný, Mr Bronislaw **Korfanty**, Mr Anatoliy **Korobeynikov**, Mr Ertuğrul Kumcuoğlu, Mr Flemming Damgaard Larsen, Mr Bob Laxton, Mr Harald Leibrecht, Mrs Anna **Lilliehöök**, Mr Arthur Loepfe, Mr Denis MacShane, Mr Yevhen Marmazov, Mr Jean-Pierre Masseret, Mr Miloš **Melčák**, Mr José **Mendes Bota**, Mr Attila Mesterházy, Mr Alejandro Muñoz Alonso (alternate: Mr Pedro María **Azpiazu Uriarte**), Mrs Olga Nachtmannová, Mrs Hermine

Naghdalyan, Mr Gebhard Negele, Mrs Mirosława **Nykiel**, Mr Mark Oaten, Mrs Ganira Pashayeva, Mrs Marija Pejčinović-Burić, Mr Viktor **Pleskachevskiy**, Mr Jakob Presečnik, Mr Maximilian Reimann, Mr Andrea Rigoni, Mrs Maria de Belém Roseira (alternate: Mr Maximiano **Martins**), Mr Giuseppe Saro, Mr Samad Seyidov, Mr Steingrímur J. Sigfússon, Mr Leonid Slutsky (alternate: Mrs Natalia **Burykina**), Mr Serhiy **Sobolev**, Mr Christophe Steiner, Mr Vyacheslav Timchenko (alternate: Mr Yury **Isaev**), Mrs Arenca Trashani, Mrs Ester Tuiksoo, Mr Oldřich Vojtř, Mr Konstantinos **Vrettos**, Mr Harm Evert Waalkens, Mr Paul **Wille**, Mrs Maryam Yazdanfar.

NB: The names of the members who took part in the meeting are printed in **bold**.

Secretariat of the committee: Mr Newman, Mr de Buyer and Mr Chahbazian.