



Doc. 13157 – Compendium of written amendments

(Final version)

Violence against religious communities

Contents	Page
A. Draft Resolution	2

A. Draft Resolution

1. The Parliamentary Assembly is concerned about the increasing occurrence of violent attacks against religious communities throughout the world. It notes that there is not only physical, but also psychological violence against persons because of their religion and it condemns such violence in unequivocal terms.
2. The Assembly recalls that freedom of thought, conscience and religion are universal human rights enshrined in Article 9 of the European Convention on Human Rights (ETS No. 5) and Article 18 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, which every member State of the United Nations has committed to uphold: "Everyone has the right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion; this right includes freedom to change his religion or belief, and freedom, either alone or in community with others and in public or private, to manifest his religion or belief, in teaching, practice, worship and observance."
3. The Assembly also wishes to draw attention to Article 18 of the 1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and to the 1981 United Nations Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion and Belief; moreover, it reaffirms the utmost importance of the autonomy of religious communities and of their separation from the State, as well as of the neutrality and impartiality of the State on religious matters.
4. The Assembly has consistently drawn attention to the importance of upholding freedom of conscience and of religion, which can only be subject to the limitations that are necessary in a democratic society. The following texts are relevant in this context: Recommendation 1162 (1991) on the contribution of the Islamic civilisation to European culture; Recommendation 1396 (1999) on religion and democracy; Recommendation 1720 (2005) on education

Amendment 25

Tabled by Mr Michael CONNARTY, Mr Ian LIDDELL-GRAINGER, Mr Jim SHERIDAN, Dame Angela WATKINSON, Mr John PRESCOTT

In the draft resolution, paragraph 1, in the first sentence, replace the words "against religious communities throughout the world" with the following words: "against religious communities and individuals throughout the world on the basis of their religion or belief" ; and in the second sentence, after the word "religion" insert the following words: "or beliefs".

Amendment 21

Tabled by Mr Andreas GROSS, Ms Anne BRASSEUR, Mr Tiny KOX, Mr Mogens JENSEN, Ms Carina HÄGG, Ms Carina OHLSSON, Mr Mike HANCOCK, Ms Tina ACKETOFT, Ms Gülsün BİLGEHAN, Mr Robert BIEDROŃ, Mr Jonas GUNNARSSON, Ms Iwona GUZOWSKA

Replace the title of the Resolution with the following words: "Safeguarding human rights in relation to religion and belief".

and religion; Resolution 1464 (2005) on women and religion in Europe; Resolution 1510 (2006) on freedom of expression and respect for religious beliefs; Recommendation 1804 (2007) on State, religion, secularity and human rights; Resolution 1535 (2007) on threats to the lives and freedom of expression of journalists; Resolution 1580 (2007) on the dangers of creationism in education; Resolution 1605 (2008) and Recommendation 1831 (2008) on European Muslim communities confronted with extremism; Recommendation 1805 (2007) on blasphemy, religious insults and hate speech against persons on grounds of their religion; Resolution 1743 (2010) and Recommendation 1927 (2010) on Islam, Islamism and Islamophobia in Europe; and Recommendation 1957 (2011) on violence against Christians in the Middle East.

5. It recalls, in particular, Resolution 1510 (2006) on freedom of expression and respect for religious beliefs, in which it stated that "freedom of expression as protected under Article 10 of the European Convention on Human Rights should not be further restricted to meet increasing sensitivities of certain religious groups". It emphasises that, as a general rule, freedom of expression should not be restricted to meet the sensitivities of any group in a democratic society.

Amendment 1

Tabled by Ms Pelin GÜNDEŞ BAKIR, Mr Şaban DİŞLİ, Mr Ahmet Kutalmış TÜRKEŞ, Mr Samad SEYİDOV, Ms Sevinj FATALIYEVA, Ms Sahiba GAFAROVA

In the draft resolution, after paragraph 5, insert the following paragraph:

"Caricatures and films ridiculing or insulting a religion is not freedom of expression but quite the contrary an indication of intolerance and xenophobia. The aim is to provoke the believers of that religion. These types of acts do not contribute to world peace or the world's intellectual heritage, do not add anything positive to any society except for segregation and hurt. The Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe calls on all member states to ensure respect for all religious and sacred symbols, religious figures, holy books, Prophets and God, as the opposite deeply hurts the devout believers of a religion, who can believe that their identity and community is being victimized if their religion or its sacred symbols are subjected to public ridicule or vilification. This offence should be considered within the framework of 'hate crimes'."

Amendment 7

Tabled by the (Former) Committee on Migration, Refugees and Displaced Persons

In the draft resolution, after paragraph 5, insert the following paragraph:

"The Assembly condemns any instances of negative stereotyping of persons based on religion as well as the advocacy of religious hatred that constitutes incitement to discrimination, hostility or violence."

6. The Assembly also wishes to insist on the need to combat all forms of religious fundamentalism and of manipulation of religious beliefs, which are so often the cause of present-day terrorism. Education and dialogue are two

Amendment 22

Tabled by Mr Şaban DİŞLİ, Mr Mevlüt ÇAVUŞOĞLU, Mr Ahmet Kutalmış TÜRKEŞ,

important tools that can contribute towards the prevention of such negative and dangerous trends.

7. While it is generally accepted that religious communities are better protected in Europe than in Africa, Asia and the Middle East, there are still problems being reported in Council of Europe member States.

Ms Ganira PASHAYEVA, Ms Tülin ERKAL KARA

In the draft resolution, paragraph 6, replace the words ", which are so often the cause of present-day terrorism" with the following words: "for terrorist purposes".

Amendment 2

(If adopted, amendments 9, 11 falls)

Tabled by Ms Pelin GÜNDEŞ BAKIR, Mr Şaban DİŞLİ, Mr Ahmet Kutalmış TÜRKES, Mr Samad SEYIDOV, Ms Sevinj FATALIYEVA, Ms Sahiba GAFAROVA

In the draft resolution, delete paragraph 7.

Amendment 9

(Falls if amendment 2 is adopted)

Tabled by Mr Márton BRAUN, Mr Gergely GULYÁS, Mr Ferenc KALMÁR, Mr Pedro AGRAMUNT, Mr Giorgi KANDELAKI, Ms Carmen QUINTANILLA

In the draft resolution, at the end of paragraph 7, insert the following words: "In some member states in particular, recent constitutional reforms raise serious concerns with regard to their compatibility with Article 9 of the European Convention on Human Rights"

Amendment 11

(Falls if amendment 2 is adopted)

Tabled by Lord Donald ANDERSON, Sir Christopher CHOPE, Lord John E. TOMLINSON, Dame Cheryl GILLAN, Mr Jim DOBBIN

In the draft resolution, at the end of paragraph 7, insert the following words: "The Assembly accepts that, if we are to be credible in our representations to non-member countries, such problems must be recognised, confronted and eliminated."

8. The Assembly therefore calls on member States to:

Amendment 12

Tabled by Lord Donald ANDERSON, Sir Christopher CHOPE, Lord John E. TOMLINSON, Dame Cheryl GILLAN, Mr Jim DOBBIN

In the draft resolution, after paragraph 8, insert the following paragraph:

"The Assembly further urges those non-member states which have the status of Partners for Democracy, to move steadily to acceptance of

the above principles and values and resolves to monitor their compliance."

- 8.1. reaffirm that respect of human rights, democracy and civil liberties is a common basis on which they build their relations with third countries, and ensure that a democracy clause, incorporating religious freedom, is included in agreements between them and third countries;

Amendment 16

Tabled by Mr Andreas GROSS, Ms Anne BRASSEUR, Mr Tiny KOX, Mr Mogens JENSEN, Ms Carina HÄGG, Ms Carina OHLSSON, Mr Mike HANCOCK, Ms Tina ACKETOFT, Ms Gülsün BİLGEHAN, Mr Robert BIEDROŃ, Mr Jonas GUNNARSSON, Ms Iwona GUZOWSKA

In the draft resolution, before paragraph 8.1, insert the following paragraph:

"ensure equality of treatment before the State and public authorities of all individuals and communities regardless of religion, faith or non-religious beliefs;"

- 8.2. take account of the situation of religious communities in their bilateral political dialogue with the countries concerned;

Amendment 10

Tabled by Mr Márton BRAUN, Mr Axel FISCHER, Mr Gergely GULYÁS, Mr Ferenc KALMÁR, Mr Pedro AGRAMUNT, Mr Giorgi KANDELAKI, Ms Carmen QUINTANILLA

In the draft resolution, at the end of paragraph 8.2, insert the following words: "in particular those countries in which blasphemy laws are in force".

- 8.3. reaffirm that freedom of religion, conscience and belief is an essential part of the European human rights system guaranteed by the European Convention on Human Rights;

- 8.4. comply with their commitments and obligations to guarantee the full enjoyment of this fundamental right;

Amendment 18

Tabled by Mr Andreas GROSS, Ms Anne BRASSEUR, Mr Tiny KOX, Mr Mogens JENSEN, Ms Carina HÄGG, Ms Carina OHLSSON, Mr Mike HANCOCK, Ms Tina ACKETOFT, Ms Gülsün BİLGEHAN, Mr Robert BIEDROŃ, Mr Jonas GUNNARSSON, Ms Iwona GUZOWSKA

In the draft resolution, after paragraph 8.4, insert the following paragraph:

"note the particular status of women and girls in many traditional religious settings and to protect women and girls and to ensure that religion can never be invoked to justify violence against women, such as honour killings, bride burning, forced marriages, female genital mutilation, even by members of their own religious communities;"

- 8.5. promote, both at national and Committee of Ministers level, a policy which takes into consideration the question of the full respect for, and the effective protection of, the

Amendment 26

Tabled by Mr Michael CONNARTY, Mr Ian LIDDELL-GRAINGER, Mr Jim SHERIDAN,

fundamental rights of religious minorities in foreign relations;

Dame Angela WATKINSON, Mr John PRESCOTT

In the draft resolution, paragraph 8.5, replace the words "religious minorities" with the following words: "minorities defined by their religion or belief".

Amendment 17

Tabled by Mr Andreas GROSS, Ms Anne BRASSEUR, Mr Tiny KOX, Mr Mogens JENSEN, Ms Carina HÄGG, Mr Mike HANCOCK, Ms Tina ACKETOFT, Ms Gülsün BİLGEHAN, Mr Robert BIEDROŃ, Mr Jonas GUNNARSSON, Ms Iwona GUZOWSKA

In the draft resolution, after paragraph 8.5, insert the following paragraph:

"ensure that the religious beliefs and traditions of individuals and communities of the society are respected, while guaranteeing that a due balance is struck with the rights of others in accordance with the case law of the European Court on Human Rights;"

8.6. accommodate religious beliefs in the public sphere by guaranteeing freedom of thought in relation to health care, education and the civil service;

Amendment 13

Tabled by Mr Andreas GROSS, Ms Anne BRASSEUR, Mr Tiny KOX, Mr Mogens JENSEN, Ms Carina HÄGG, Ms Carina OHLSSON, Mr Mike HANCOCK, Ms Tina ACKETOFT, Ms Gülsün BİLGEHAN, Mr Robert BIEDROŃ, Mr Jonas GUNNARSSON, Ms Iwona GUZOWSKA

In the draft resolution, at the end of paragraph 8.6, add the following words: "provided that the rights of others to be free from discrimination are respected and that the access to lawful services is guaranteed;"

8.7. ensure the right to well-defined conscientious objection in relation to morally sensitive matters, such as military service, in line also with various recommendations already adopted by the Assembly;

Amendment 4

Tabled by Mr Ferenc KALMÁR, Mr Miloš ALIGRUDIĆ, Mr David DAVIES, Mr Josep Anton BARDINA PAU, Ms Carmen QUINTANILLA

In the draft resolution, paragraph 8.7, after the words "such as military service", insert the following words: "or other services related to health-care and education,".

Amendment 14

Tabled by Mr Andreas GROSS, Ms Anne BRASSEUR, Mr Tiny KOX, Mr Mogens JENSEN, Ms Carina HÄGG, Ms Carina OHLSSON, Mr Mike HANCOCK, Ms Tina ACKETOFT, Ms Gülsün BİLGEHAN, Mr

**Robert BIEDROŃ, Mr Jonas GUNNARSSON,
Ms Iwona GUZOWSKA**

In the draft resolution, at the end of paragraph 8.7, add the following words: "provided that the rights of others to be free from discrimination are respected and that the access to lawful services is guaranteed;"

- 8.8. in full respect of the values that are the very essence of the Council of Europe, protect the liberty of parents, including in loco parentis, to ensure the religious and moral education and teaching of their children;

Amendment 15

Tabled by Mr Andreas GROSS, Ms Anne BRASSEUR, Mr Tiny KOX, Mr Mogens JENSEN, Ms Carina HÄGG, Ms Carina OHLSSON, Mr Mike HANCOCK, Ms Tina ACKETOFT, Ms Gülsün BİLGEHAN, Mr Robert BIEDROŃ, Mr Jonas GUNNARSSON, Ms Iwona GUZOWSKA

In the draft resolution, replace paragraph 8.8 with the following paragraph:

"while guaranteeing the fundamental right of children to education in an objective, critical and pluralistic manner, respect the right of parents to ensure such education and teaching in conformity with their own religious and philosophical convictions;"

- 8.9. change their legal regulations whenever these go against the freedom of association for religious groups and churches;

Amendment 27

(If adopted, amendments 3, 23 falls)

Tabled by Mr Michael CONNARTY, Mr Ian LIDDELL-GRAINGER, Mr Jim SHERIDAN, Dame Angela WATKINSON, Mr John PRESCOTT

In the draft resolution, paragraph 8.9, replace the words "religious groups and churches" with the following words: "groups (including churches) defined by their religion or belief".

Amendment 3

(Falls if amendment 27 is adopted)

(If adopted, amendment 23 falls)

Tabled by Ms Pelin GÜNDEŞ BAKIR, Mr Şaban DİŞLİ, Mr Ahmet Kutalmış TÜRKEŞ, Mr Samad SEYİDOV, Ms Sevinj FATALIYEVA, Ms Sahiba GAFAROVA

In the draft resolution, in paragraph 8.9, replace the word "churches" with the following word: "places".

Amendment 23

(Falls if amendments 27, 3 are adopted)

Tabled by Mr Şaban DİŞLİ, Mr Mevlüt ÇAVUŞOĞLU, Mr Ahmet Kutalmış TÜRKEŞ,

- 8.10. ensure the full respect of Article 9 of the European Convention on Human Rights and that the freedom of religious communities is respected and exercised within the limits of the law.

Ms Ganira PASHAYEVA, Ms Tülin ERKAL KARA

In the draft resolution, paragraph 8.9, after the word "churches", add the following words: "and mosques".

Amendment 19

Tabled by Mr Andreas GROSS, Ms Anne BRASSEUR, Mr Tiny KOX, Mr Mogens JENSEN, Ms Carina HÄGG, Ms Carina OHLSSON, Mr Mike HANCOCK, Ms Tina ACKETOFT, Ms Gülsün BİLGEHAN, Mr Robert BIEDROŃ, Mr Jonas GUNNARSSON, Ms Iwona GUZOWSKA

In the draft resolution, paragraph 8.10, after the words "the European Convention on Human Rights", insert the following words: "and relevant jurisprudence by the ECHR since 1949".

Amendment 28

Tabled by Mr Michael CONNARTY, Mr Ian LIDDELL-GRAINGER, Mr Jim SHERIDAN, Dame Angela WATKINSON, Mr John PRESCOTT

In the draft resolution, paragraph 8.10, replace the words "religious communities" with the following words: "communities and individuals defined by religion or belief".

Amendment 5

Tabled by the (Former) Committee on Migration, Refugees and Displaced Persons

In the draft resolution, after paragraph 8.10, insert the following paragraph:

"recognise the need to provide international protection for those seeking asylum due to religious persecution".

Amendment 6

Tabled by the (Former) Committee on Migration, Refugees and Displaced Persons

In the draft resolution, after paragraph 8.10, insert the following paragraph:

"duly take into account the possible overlap between racism, xenophobia and religious hatred, keeping in mind that these phenomena are often directed against migrant communities."

9. The Assembly further urges all States in which violence against religious communities has occurred to:

Amendment 29

Tabled by Mr Michael CONNARTY, Mr Ian LIDDELL-GRAINGER, Mr Jim SHERIDAN,

Dame Angela WATKINSON, Mr John PRESCOTT

In the draft resolution, paragraph 9, replace the words "religious communities" with the following words: "communities and individuals defined by religion or belief".

- 9.1. unequivocally condemn not only attacks on innocent people, but also the use of violence in general, as well as all forms of discrimination and intolerance based on religion and beliefs;

Amendment 24

Tabled by Mr Şaban DİŞLİ, Mr Mevlüt ÇAVUŞOĞLU, Mr Ahmet Kutalmış TÜRKEŞ, Ms Ganira PASHAYEVA, Ms Tülin ERKAL KARA

In the draft resolution, paragraph 9.1, after the word "intolerance", add the following words: ", including hate speech,".

- 9.2. pursue and reinforce their efforts to combat and prevent such cases and bring to justice the perpetrators;
- 9.3. promote correct and objective education about religions, including those of minorities;

Amendment 30

Tabled by Mr Michael CONNARTY, Mr Ian LIDDELL-GRAINGER, Mr Jim SHERIDAN, Dame Angela WATKINSON, Mr John PRESCOTT

In the draft resolution, paragraph 9.3, after the word "religions" insert the following words: "and non-religious beliefs".

- 9.4. actively support initiatives aimed at promoting the inter-religious dimension of dialogue;

Amendment 31

Tabled by Mr Michael CONNARTY, Mr Ian LIDDELL-GRAINGER, Mr Jim SHERIDAN, Dame Angela WATKINSON, Mr John PRESCOTT

In the draft resolution, paragraph 9.4, replace the words "inter-religious" with the following words: "inter-cultural".

- 9.5. ensure the effective protection of religious communities and of their places of worship, including those of minorities;

Amendment 32

Tabled by Mr Michael CONNARTY, Mr Ian LIDDELL-GRAINGER, Mr Jim SHERIDAN, Dame Angela WATKINSON, Mr John PRESCOTT

In the draft resolution, paragraph 9.5, replace the words "religious communities" with the words "communities and individuals defined by religion or belief"; and after the word "their" insert the following words: "meeting places and".

- 9.6. respect and protect the cultural heritage of the various religions.

Amendment 33

Tabled by Mr Michael CONNARTY, Mr Ian LIDDELL-GRAINGER, Mr Jim SHERIDAN,

10. The Assembly calls on all religious leaders in Europe to condemn attacks on religious communities and other faith groups, and to accept the principle of equal respect for all human beings regardless of their religion.

Dame Angela WATKINSON, Mr John PRESCOTT

In the draft resolution, paragraph 9.6, after the word "religions" add the following words: "and non-religious beliefs".

Amendment 34

Tabled by Mr Michael CONNARTY, Mr Ian LIDDELL-GRAINGER, Mr Jim SHERIDAN, Dame Angela WATKINSON, Mr John PRESCOTT

In the draft resolution, paragraph 10, replace the words "religious leaders" with the words "religious, humanist and secularist leaders"; replace the words "other faith groups" with the words "other belief groups"; and after the word "religion" add the words "or belief".

Amendment 8

Tabled by Mr Ferenc KALMÁR, Mr Miloš ALIGRUDIĆ, Mr David DAVIES, Mr Josep Anton BARDINA PAU, Ms Carmen QUINTANILLA

In the draft resolution, after paragraph 10, insert the following paragraph:

"The Council of Europe urges Member States where the restitution of church property is not yet concluded, to speed up this process and finish it in short or medium term. The process should not be negatively affected or influenced by any political ideology or government."

11. Finally, the Assembly calls on the European Union to enhance its monitoring of the situation of religious communities in its political dialogue with non-member countries, and to link its European Neighbourhood Policy, including financial aid, to the degree of human rights protection, including that of freedom of religion, and awareness in those countries.

Amendment 35

Tabled by Mr Michael CONNARTY, Mr Ian LIDDELL-GRAINGER, Mr Jim SHERIDAN, Dame Angela WATKINSON, Mr John PRESCOTT

In the draft resolution, paragraph 11, replace the words "religious communities" with the words "communities and individuals defined by religion or belief".

Amendment 20

(If adopted, amendment 36 falls)

Tabled by Mr Andreas GROSS, Ms Anne BRASSEUR, Mr Tiny KOX, Mr Mogens JENSEN, Ms Carina HÄGG, Ms Carina OHLSSON, Mr Mike HANCOCK, Ms Tina ACKETOFT, Ms Gülsün BİLGEHAN, Mr Robert BIEDROŃ, Mr Jonas GUNNARSSON, Ms Iwona GUZOWSKA

In the draft resolution, paragraph 11, delete the words "and to link its European Neighbourhood Policy, including financial aid, to the degree of human rights protection, including that of

freedom of religion, and awareness in those countries".

Amendment 36

(Falls if amendment 20 is adopted)

Tabled by Mr Michael CONNARTY, Mr Ian LIDDELL-GRAINGER, Mr Jim SHERIDAN, Dame Angela WATKINSON, Mr John PRESCOTT

In the draft resolution, paragraph 11, after the word "religion", insert the following words: "and belief".